THE DONALD MACKAY CHURCHILL FELLOWSHIP

to study methods to combat trafficking of women for sexual servitude and prostitution, within mining towns, through organised crime fuelled, by growth within the mining industry

I understand that the Churchill Trust may publish this report, either in hard copy or on the internet or both, and consent to such publication.

I indemnify the Churchill Trust against any loss, cost or damages it may suffer arising out of any claim or proceeding made against the Trust in respect of or arising out of the publication of any report submitted to the Trust and which the Trust places on a website for access over the internet.

I also warrant that my final report is original and does not infringe the copyright of any person, or contain anything which is, or the incorporation of which into the final report is, actionable for defamation, a breach of any privacy law or obligation, breach of confidence, contempt of court, passing-off or contravention of any other private right or of any law.

Signed: Paul Biggin

Dated: 04/02/2014
I joined the Queensland Police Service in 1986 and have undertaken operational policing roles throughout the state. In 2007 I was awarded the Courier-Mail Police Scholarship to research Human Trafficking of women for sexual servitude and made a number of recommendations to the Queensland Police Service. I have completed a Masters of Professional Studies through the University of Southern Queensland and from 2009 to 2013 undertook duties as the Inspector of police of Mount Isa. The city is a large mining community located in North West Queensland, which is currently the largest copper producer in Australia and one of the world’s biggest underground mines.

Inspector Paul Biggin
Queensland Police Service, Australia
Phone: +61 7 41285319
Biggin.paulm@police.qld.gov.au
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.........................................................................................4

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY..........................................................................................5

FELLOWSHIP PROGRAM (24 SEPTEMBER – 7 NOVEMBER 2013).......................................8
  Country selection..................................................................................................11

INTRODUCTION.......................................................................................................15
  The Challenge......................................................................................................16
  Mindsets...............................................................................................................19
  Ownership of the problem (Trafficking in Persons)..............................................23
  World Viewpoint and Potential Economic Loss..................................................25
  Organised Crime..................................................................................................26
  The Need for Intelligence.....................................................................................29
  Early intervention and Education........................................................................31
  Trafficking in Persons Laws................................................................................33
  Joint Taskforce Methodology.............................................................................35
  Commitment to the Protection of Victims............................................................37
  Investment in Training.........................................................................................38
  Mining Industry..................................................................................................41
  Reason for Change..............................................................................................43

CONCLUSIONS.......................................................................................................44

RECOMMENDATIONS............................................................................................46

COLLAGE OF PHOTOS..........................................................................................49
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To travel overseas as the recipient of the 2012 Donald Mackay Churchill Fellowship has been an honour and one which I have been extremely fortunate to receive.

The Fellowship is for the study of countering organised crime and was established in 1989.

Firstly, I would like to thank the Winston Churchill Memorial Trust and the Queensland selection panel who believed in the merit of my project and my ability to complete such a project. I also wish to sincerely thank the Griffith Rotary Club of New South Wales who sponsor and enable a perpetual Churchill Fellowship to be awarded each year in the field of countering organised crime in the memory of Donald Mackay who was assassinated in Griffith, New South Wales on 15 of July 1977 as a consequence of his resistance to organised crime in Australia.

Secondly, I would like to thank the Queensland Police Service for supporting me to undertake this trip to enable me to investigate operational methods to combat trafficking of women for sexual servitude and prostitution within mining towns through organised crime fuelled by growth within the mining industry.

Finally, I would like to sincerely thank the support of my family, my friends and the dedicated law enforcement officers and agencies who throughout my journey, expressed their utmost support and allowed me to undertake this project.

Please Note

The views expressed in this report are solely those of the author and do not necessarily reflect those of the Queensland Police Service or the Winston Churchill Memorial Trust.

Any errors or omissions in content throughout this report are the sole responsibility of the author.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Project Description

Every day vulnerable young women are being either coerced into prostitution or forced to undertake sex acts associated with exploitation. This is conducted through threats or actual violence, intimidation, reputational harm or retaliation against family members in the name of greed. These women become complicate through circumstances often beyond their control. This is due to family breakdowns, drug dependence, financial hardship or simply vulnerability through a range of situations. These include the threat of exposure or release of videos, photos of themselves involving nudity, sexual acts or pornography through social media sites and SMS messages to friends, relatives or the general public. Through this coercion they can then be forced into illegal prostitution, linked to human trafficking, and exposed to the horrors of physical and physiological trauma that can remain with them for the rest of their lives.

The focus of this research was to examine and recommend tangible strategies in order to minimise the exposure of victims to these crimes and identify strategies to specifically target trafficking perpetrators and relieve the suffering of these women. This project is not about targeting sex workers or implementing additional layers of bureaucracy to the sex industry, rather it is an examination of operational efficiencies and the coordination of intelligence specifically generated at trafficking offenders and identifying victims. It is also about the linkage of support programs to law enforcement agencies by Non-Government Organisations (NGO’s) with a mandate to protect victims.

While the scope of the project was centred on mining communities, it is acutely apparent that trafficking is not confined to mining areas. There is an abundance of documented academic literature and supporting evidence outlining the enormity of the problem facing every government and law enforcement agency throughout the world.

The research project I undertook examined a wide variety of operational law enforcement methodologies and strategies to target and address trafficking of women for sexual exploitation. This was to enable effective targeting of organised individuals (pimps) and crime associates in Canada, United States of America, Philippines and Chile. This was also overlayed with both government and NGO strategies and the working relationships that existed with law enforcement to combat the problem. Similar to the David and Goliath struggle, the rapid expansion of trafficking for prostitution is a major challenge for governments and law enforcement agencies. Considerable effort and resources has and still is being committed through government departments, agencies and geographic locations designed to focus on the activity of perpetrators. I witnessed this while visiting and meeting international agencies and jurisdictions in the research countries.
During my research, I was exposed to numerous examples of innovative and effective targeting of this crime, particularly in the areas of perception of victims and the overwhelming need to focus more on the organised crime elements behind the victims. There is considerable emphasis by government placed on the priority of safe communities and the protection of women in Australia. There is a need for this to translate across law enforcement agencies and the wider community. Government and law enforcement agencies are required to instigate more aggressive targeting of organised individuals and groups behind this crime.

**Highlights**

**CANADA**
- Human Trafficking National Coordination Centre, Federal/International Ops, Ottawa
- OPAPA human trafficking case – meeting with Arresting Officer, RCMP, Hamilton
- Manager, Migration Intelligence Section, Toronto
- Human Trafficking Units within Peel and Niagara
- Sex Crimes Unit Special Projects, Toronto
- Chief of Intelligence, Intelligence Division, Toronto
- Serious and Organised Crime Unit, Royal Canadian Mounted Police, Hamilton
- Risk Management Unit, Toronto
- Correctional Service of Canada, Bath Institution, Bath, Ontario
- Canada Boarder Services Agency (CBSA)
- International Airport, Human Trafficking Training seminar, Toronto
- Attended proactive enforcement operations with CBSA
- Assistant Crown Attorney, Ministry of the Attorney General, Ontario
- Walk with Me Canada Victim Services, Hamilton and Niagara
- Prostitution reporting and tracking of victims, Regional Police, Peel
- Human Trafficking cases - Magistrates and District Courts, Peel
- Institute on Governance, Ontario
- Police and Peace Officers Memorial Day march, Ottawa.

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA**
- Deepest open cut pit mine in the world (Bingham Canyon Copper Mine)
- Director of Security Services, Rio Tinto, Kennecott Utah
- Meeting with Utah Attorney General’s Chief of Law Enforcement, Utah
- Attended warrant operations with Secure Strike Force, Utah
- Meeting with FBI Safe Streets Task Force, Special Operations Division, Utah
- FBI, US Department of Justice, Utah
- FBI, US Department of Justice, Buffalo, New York
- Internal Affairs Unit, West Valley City Police Department
- Buffalo Intelligence Unit, Buffalo, New York
- Ride-alongs West Valley City Police Department, Utah
- US Customs and Boarder Protection, US Department of Homeland Security
- International Institute of Buffalo for victims services, Buffalo, New York.
PHILIPPINES
- Australian Embassy, Manila
- United States of America Embassy, Manila
- Department of Justice, Manila
- Australian Federal Police, Manila
- Burgos Street, Makati, Manila
- USAID Office of Economic Development and Governance, Manila.

CHILE
- United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR Office), Santiago
- Australian Embassy, Santiago
- First Secretary, Political Affairs, United States of America Embassy, Santiago
- Presidential Palace – Organised Crime Department, Santiago.

Recommendations

This report puts forward a range of recommendations that represent significant opportunity for Australia to enhance capacity and capability towards government goals and commitment to community safety. This will ensure that states and territories are the most difficult places for organised crime to conduct trafficking in persons for prostitution anywhere the world. The recommendations provide the platform for government and law enforcement to provide sustainable service delivery within a whole of government framework in delivering the best protection services while targeting this unique element of organised crime.

- To create an offence of trafficking in persons under the Criminal Code in all state and territories to target the specific crime of domestic trafficking for sexual exploitation
- To create a joint task force in each state and territory to coordinate the sourcing, collection and response on all facets of trafficking in persons intelligence. This would be achieved through a collaborative approach between law enforcement agencies in partnership with NGOs, emergency services, accommodation providers and the broader community
- To identify and prioritise capability training for all frontline emergency service officers including investigation and intelligence training for law enforcement officers, incorporated with the development of nationally recognised indicators of victims of trafficking
- To create national trafficking in persons awareness programs aimed at the broader community and focused on engaging volunteers and industry groups. This will target groups - tourism industry (accommodation providers), trades and services sector (hairdressers, manicure outlets, lingerie clothing outlets etc)
- To establish centralised monitoring in each state and territory of domestic disturbances linked to the accommodation industry for mandated compliance reporting of potential trafficking in persons victims. This would be through designated intelligence officers for rapid reporting for frontline responses.
• To amend the Code of Conduct and practices in the mining industry for stricter compliance of the workforce through contractual compliance reducing the demand for traffickers to operate in remote areas
• To structure the inductions of new employees in the mining industry to include training indicators of trafficking in persons victims in the sex industry, through agreed NGO service providers
• To provide suitable education and training opportunities to enable the effective and efficient delivery of awareness programs by appointed NGOs for all secondary students prior to Year 10 on indicators of domestic trafficking.

Dissemination of findings

• This report and its findings will be disseminated through the following methods:
  • Winston Churchill Memorial Trust Website
  • Queensland Police Service
  • Submission of report to the Australian Police Journal
  • Government, NGOs, industry and academic bodies through existing contacts and networks nationally and internationally
  • Presentation to the Combined Services Clubs of Griffith, NSW
  • Presentation of findings at upcoming mining conferences and seminars through existing contacts.

FELLOWSHIP PROGRAM – 2013

As the recipient of the Donald Mackay Churchill Fellowship I studied methods to combat trafficking women for sexual servitude and prostitution in mining towns. I visited Canada, the United States of America, Philippines and Chile which I believed offered the greatest opportunities to undertake comparisons afforded to law enforcement within Australia. The countries also offered uniqueness in a variety of areas including culture, geography, mining Industries, law enforcement agencies and laws, legislation and policies pertaining to trafficking in persons.

Outline of areas visited during Fellowship:

• Toronto, Ontario, Canada (24 September -27 September 2013)
• Ottawa, Ontario, Canada (28 September – 01 October 2013)
• Bath, Ontario, Canada (01 October 2013)
• Niagara Falls, Ontario, Canada (02 October 2013)
• Buffalo, New York, United States of America (03 October 2013)
• Stoney Creek, Ontario, Canada (04 October- 06 October 2013)Peel, Ontario, Canada (07 October – 08 October 2013)
• Niagara Falls/Hamilton, Ontario, Canada (09 October 2013)
• Buffalo, New York, United States of America (10 October 2013)
• Salt Lake City, Utah, United States of America (11 October – 20 October 2013)
• West Valley City and Park City, Utah, United States of America (19 October 2013)
• Manila, Philippines (22 October – 26 October 2013)
• Santiago, Chile, South America (28 October – 07 October 2013)

CANADA – 24/09/2013 – 10/10/2013

• CBC Broadcasting Network, Toronto
• Intelligence Office, Canada Boarder Services Agency Greater Toronto Region
• Sex Crimes Unit, Special Projects, Police Service, Toronto
• Sex Crimes Unit, Special Victims Section, Police Service, Toronto
• Operations Reboot, Police Service, Toronto
• Financial Crimes Unit, Corporate Crimes/Social Media, Police Service, Toronto
• Professional Standards (Toronto Police Operations Centre), Toronto
• Police and Peace Officers Memorial Service at Parliament House, Ottawa
• Safety Compliance (Fleet), CCG Safety and Security, Toronto
• Migration Intelligence, Intelligence Operations and Analysis Division. CBSA
• National Intelligence Priorities and Planning – National Intelligence Coordination Centre, Ottawa
• Bath Correctional Centre, Correctional Service, Bath
• Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI), Buffalo, New York, USA
• Buffalo Sector Intelligence Unit , New York, USA
• Serious and Organised Crime Unit, Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) Hamilton Niagara Region
• NGO - Walk With Me Canada Victim Services. Stoney Creek
• Toronto International Airport - Boarder Services Officer, Canadian Boarder Services Agency, Toronto
• Major Drugs and Vice Bureau, Peel Regional Police, Peel
• Assistant Crown Attorney’s office, Ministry of the Attorney General, Peel
• District Court Building, Peel
• Licensing Unit, Niagara Regional Police, Niagara
• Institute on Governance, Niagara
• United States Boarder Patrol, RCMP, Hamilton
• Buffalo Sector Intelligence Unit, United States Border Patrol, Buffalo, New York, USA
• Homeland Security Investigations, US Immigration and Customs Buffalo, New York, USA
• Enforcement, Buffalo Sector, Homeland Security Investigations, US Immigration and Customs Enforcement, Buffalo, New York, USA
• International Institute for Victims Services Program, Buffalo, New York, USA
• Director General (retired) Criminal Intelligence, RCMP, Niagara.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA – UTAH – 11/10/2013 – 20/10/2013

• SECURE Strike Force, Salt Lake City, Utah
• Bingham Canyon mine, Kennecott Utah Copper, Salt Lake City, Utah
• Internal Affairs Unit, West Valley City Police Department, Salt Lake City, Utah
• FBI Safe Streets Task Force, Special Ops Division, Salt Lake City, Utah
• Security Services, Kennecott Utah Mines, Salt Lake City, Utah
• Salt Lake City Police Department, Salt Lake City, Utah
• West Valley City Police Department, Salt Lake City, Utah
• Attorney General’s Office, Salt Lake City, Utah
• Founder of Nestfoundation (USA NGO).

PHILLIPPINES – 22/10/2013 – 26/10/2013

• Inter-Agency Council Against Trafficking (IACAT), Dept of Justice, Manila
• Presidential Anti-Organised Crime Commission (PAOCC), Manila
• Australian Federal Police, Manila
• Philippine Overseas Employment Administration (POEA), Manila
• Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT), Manila
• Human Rights Office, Department of State, Embassy of United States of America, Manila
• United States of America Homeland Security Investigations, Manila
• Overseas Criminal Investigation Branch, Manila
• Australian Embassy, Manila
• Burgos Street, Makati, Manila
• USAID Office of Economic Development and Governance, Manila
• Office of the Undersecretary for Migrant Workers Affairs (OUMWA) Manila
• Women and Children Protection Centre (WCPC) Manila.

CHILE – SOUTH AMERICA 22/10/2013 – 26/10/2013

• Economic and Political Affairs Office, Embassy of USA, Santiago
• Australian Embassy, Santiago
• Head of National Office, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), Santiago
• Mesa Intersectorial sobre Trata de personas (Interagency Commission on Trafficking in Persons), Santiago
A special thanks to all law enforcement officers, government and NGO officials, community members, informants and victims who were prepared to speak freely and openly to me during my research. Due to the sensitivities, security requirements and protection to be afforded to law enforcement officers, government officials, mines officials, NGOs and members of the public that wished to remain anonymous; names have been removed from this report but are available under appropriate security clearances.

**County selection**

The Trafficking In Persons (TIP) report is commissioned each year by the United States of America. It is an internal assessment of every country’s commitment in complying with the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) minimum standards of acceptable compliance. The report assigns every country throughout the world into one of four tiers as mandated to rate the placement of each country according to the country’s government action in its commitment to combat trafficking in that country.

**Tier 1:** Countries whose governments fully comply with the TVPA’s minimum standards.

**Tier 2:** Countries whose governments do not fully comply with the TVPA’s minimum standards, but are making significant efforts to bring themselves into compliance with those standards.

**Tier 2 Watch List:** Countries whose governments do not fully comply with the TVPA’s minimum standards, but are making significant efforts to bring themselves into compliance with those standards and;

(a) The absolute number of victims of severe forms of trafficking is very significant or is significantly increasing;

(b) There is a failure to provide evidence of increasing efforts to combat severe forms of trafficking in persons from the previous year; or

(c) The determination that a country is making significant efforts to bring itself into compliance with minimum standards was based on commitments by the country to take additional future steps over the next year.

**Tier 3:** Countries whose governments do not fully comply with the minimum standards and are not making significant efforts to do so.
Australia is listed as a Tier 1 country according to the 2013 TIP’s report. The notation outlines that Australia is primarily a destination country for women subjected to forced prostitution. Among a number of countries, it also lists women from the Philippines as being coerced into prostitution in both legal and illegal brothels. It also lists that a small number of teenage girls are exploited within Australia, as evidenced during my research in Canada listed below as outlined in the notation for their tier placement.

The methodology for the countries selected to undertake this research was as follows:-

Canada

Although separated by a distance of around 14000km, Canada and Australia are the most similar in comparison of the four countries selected. In fact, Canada is widely viewed and measured as a sister country to Australia and was selected primarily because of the many similarities between the two. Australia and Canada are both English speaking nations and independent former colonies of Britain, but today remain as Commonwealth countries aligned to many political traditions with the Queen of England as the royal monarch and respective governor generals in each country. Both countries are structured similar with states and provinces without physical borders or restrictions on movement. Canada possesses ten provinces and three territories, while Australia has six states and two territories. Australia’s land mass is approximately 7.7 million square kilometres compared to Canada which has 9.9 million square kilometres. Both countries are relatively isolated and sparsely populated with Canada’s population being approximately 35 million people and Australia’s being 23.3 million people. Both have federal systems of government with similar immigration history with both countries possessing urbanisation rates above 80 percent. One of the other main similarities between both countries is the existence of vast wealth in mineral resources for future exploration and export which has seen great prosperity to both over many years. The nations share a very similar judicial system based on British common law which includes a Criminal Code and codes of practice for law enforcement agencies. For federal law enforcement jurisdiction, Australia has the Australian Federal Police (AFP) and Canada has the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP).

Canada is listed as a Tier 1 country in the 2013 TIP report which outlines that the country is a source, transit and destination country where Canadian women are exploited in sex trafficking within the country. The international assessment lists the Government as being fully compliant with the minimum standards for elimination of trafficking. It also made a special mention that during the year, authorities continued to strengthen law enforcement efforts, including the conviction of a record number of traffickers. Of note, as of February 2013, 72 of the 77 human sex trafficking cases were listed as being domestic sex trafficking of Canadian women involving 119
victims with street gangs and transnational organised crime syndicates predominately involved.

**United States of America (USA)**

Salt Lake City, Utah is the location of the Bingham Canyon Mine otherwise known as the Kennecott Copper Mine and remains the largest open pit mine in the world. This location was selected primarily because of the geographical and mining industry similarities with the Mount Isa Mine in Queensland where I was the Inspector of police from 2009 to 2013. Both the Bingham Mine and Mount Isa Mine are historically very old mines still in prime production with sustained workforces and surrounding infrastructure and economies. The Bingham copper mine commenced production in 1906 and Mount Isa commenced its production in 1931. Similar to Mount Isa, the Bingham Canyon Mine operates more on a residual based workforce with fly-in fly-out (FIFO) workers being limited to specialist qualifications or contractors for a specific job. Salt Lake City, Utah also has similarities to Mount Isa with its western corridors to other capital cities. Salt Lake City is known as the "Crossroads of the West" for its central geography in the western part of the United States. The Salt Lake City metropolitan area has a population of approximately 1,175,905 people.

The United States of America comprises of 17985 state and local law enforcement agencies consisting of approximately 765000 police officers. The interaction amongst federal, state, county, municipal and sheriffs’ offices is dynamic, complex and challenging across the country’s jurisdictional boundaries. The homeland security information network (HSIN) was designed to support the ability for agencies to share information and enhance cooperation among the different tiers of law enforcement.

Prior to my arrival in Utah, in September 2013, the mine experienced two significant landslides, the first being the 10th April 2013. It was the largest recorded in history on a mine site anywhere in the world with 150 million tonnes of rock falling into the bottom of the mine which I was fortunate to be able to view during my visit.

The USA is listed as a Tier 1 country in the 2013 TIP report which outlines that the country is a source, transit and destination country where both US citizens and foreign nationals are subjected to sex trafficking and exploitation.

**Republic of the Philippines**

The Philippines is located approximately 4400km from Australia and is the closest in proximity to Australia. It comprises of a population of more than 98 million people with approximately 10 million residing in the capital, Manila. The Filipino community is the seventh largest migrant population in Australia and represents 0.8% of Australia’s population. This location was selected primarily because of the geographic and mining industry similarities. The prevalence of the Filipino migrant
population in Australian mining communities was also a deciding factor in the selection process.

The Philippines National Police (PNP) is the civilian national police force of the country comprising of 140000 personnel. It’s made up of a criminal investigation and detection group with responsibility for major crime with a focus on national criminal organisations.

The Philippines is listed as a Tier 2 country in the 2013 TIP report. This outlines that the Philippines is primarily a source country for women subjected to sex trafficking, with a significant number of Filipino women being subject to sex trafficking in other countries. The Philippine government does not fully comply with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking, however the report notes that the government is making significant efforts to comply.

**Chile**

Chile produces 25% of the world’s copper production, followed by the USA (16%), Indonesia, Canada and Australia in fifth position.

The total mining sector in Australia generates an economy of 19% of the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) of $1.57 trillion dollars. Similarly, the mining sector in Chile is also heavily reliant on its mining industry, which is ranked number one in South America with the highest GDP per capita in Latin America. This location was selected primarily because of the geographic and mining industry similarities within Queensland. The major hub for mining in Chile is concentrated in the Norte Grande region spanning most of the Atacama Desert. Chile and Australia also share a male dominated workforce in the mining industry due to the nature of the work. These mining communities are generally located in the more remote and isolated regions of both countries. Santiago is the capital city of Chile. It has a population of about 7 million people, or one third of the country’s population. Many miners who can afford travel complete work after rotations and return to the large cities of Antofagasta in the north of the country or Santiago on their days off in a FIFO or drive-in drive-out capacity. Chile has two police forces. The Carabineros which are the uniformed national police force and the Investigations Police of Chile which both report to the Ministry of Interior and Public Security.

The Investigations Police of Chile have a Human Trafficking Brigade which investigates all trafficking in person’s matters. Chile is classed as a destination country for trafficking victims in addition to an increasing migration problem where other citizens from South America are attempting to migrate and settle. Prostitution in Chile is legal. Since 2011 all reported traffic in persons cases relating to prostitution have been as a result of victims escaping from traffickers in Chile. In all cases, it was identified that other women were the traffickers of these victims with physiological abuse being a factor in each of the reported cases. Most citizens in Latin America speak Spanish or can understand conversation with dialect changes,
for example speaking Portuguese in Brazil. This ability to communicate freely does not seem to have made any impact on the discovery of international victims within the country. Unlike Australia where foreign languages can be a barrier for victims to communicate with law enforcement.

Chile is listed as a Tier 2 country in the 2013 TIP report which outlines that the country is a source, transit and destination country where Chilean women are exploited in sex trafficking within the country. The international assessment lists the Government as not fully complying with the minimum standards for elimination of trafficking but highlights that the country is making significant efforts to do so.

INTRODUCTION

It is an old saying that, “if you have men, you have a prostitution problem”. While many members of the Australian community may not agree to this saying, female victims of sexual exploitation as a result of prostitution would certainly empathise with it. There are many thousands of independent and capable women who work within the sex industry throughout Australia. Many of these women would never disclose themselves as such due to the social stigma or incrimination on many levels. Regardless of identifying as a sex worker or not, a large percentage of these women are free to make everyday choices on working conditions, client selection and services to be offered and provided. This voice and the ability to determine choice cannot be said for all women in the sex industry. Vulnerable young women, particularly in remote locations such as mining communities where geographic parameters foster unchecked travel and movement throughout the country, provides ample opportunism for clandestine pimps and traffickers of persons to undertake criminal activities without leaving any virtual footprint of their existence. These victims can be migrant sex workers, international visitors or domestic residents.

Undertaking operational research while visiting various government and non government agencies in the selected countries, allowed me a unique opportunity to build on my knowledge and past studies and undertake comparisons. These included strategic issues, operational strategies and methods of enforcement in addition to support and welfare programs currently utilised in Australia. This experience enabled me to be exposed to the most innovative and contemporary approaches as well as enforcement strategies to target human trafficking of women for prostitution.

While I acknowledge that there have been significant efforts to target and disrupt perpetrators of trafficking in persons from both government and NGOs within Australia, a much greater understanding of the complexities and challenges of the problem is required. Australian law enforcement agencies must embrace the concept that ‘business as usual’ is no longer a sustainable option for the treatment of this
crime. A new holistic approach is needed to achieve sustainable reform and enhance police and community capabilities.

**The Challenge**

The 2013 TIP report defines “severe forms of trafficking in persons” as; sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion or a minor under the age of 18 years. The most significant challenge facing governments and law enforcement agencies in Australia is the gap between the number of trafficking cases reported versus actual crimes of this nature occurring in the community. My research overseas allowed me to collect anecdotal evidence from law enforcement, government, NGOs and support agencies. This evidence identified that the more investment law enforcement committed towards targeted intelligence of this crime, the more victims were identified. It is impossible to ignore the increased volume in trafficking cases occurring worldwide. This is not just in developing countries, where governments have not been as focused on this crime, but also in highly developed countries like Canada and the USA.

The pressure points for governments to target trafficking of prostitution have been historically based on the number of actual victims identified. The primary challenge for law enforcement in Australia is the ability to invest and acknowledge a crime with limited statistical data of known victims available. The Australian Institute of Criminology support the fact that a wide discrepancy exists between reported cases and estimates, due to the fear of the victims to report the crime. Operational findings supported by academic research dictate that coercion from the trafficker onto the victim dramatically distorts the ability for data collection on this crime. Victims seldom self-report or identify that they are a victim of this crime without some form of intervention by either law enforcement or a NGO. This statistical void to capture data and identify victims continues to permit traffickers to avoid detection and continue their activities due to the apparent need for continuous argument and discussions on the subject. This void reduces any progression for the prioritisation of intelligence and actual resources to be specifically allocated to address the crime.

Past debate regarding the need to aggressively target this crime has been largely tainted by the lack of understanding of trafficking, in particular the difference between victims of this crime and the victims of other serious crimes. Most serious crimes against women (for example rape) generate public backlash, which has the ability to quickly harness political pressure. This results in equally fast response from law enforcement. The short response time to these aforementioned serious crimes is attributed to the fact that the community understands and perceives the offence as a crime. However with trafficking crimes involving women and the unique way that victims view their perpetrators, this pressure to act is distorted, as is the focus on the crime. Evidence and trafficking victim accounts document many victims do not believe they are victims. The offenders rely on this gap in understanding the aspects of trafficking to avoid the same attention and subsequent allocation to intelligence
and resources that would normally be applied to other serious crimes against women.

Traffickers of women for forced prostitution are criminals, similar to drug traffickers and are in the business of greed and wealth creation at the expense of their victims. Traffickers however are refining their criminal methods by constantly evolving to modify their movements, trade and footprint. They are able to adapt to almost any situation or environment in the search of money and potential victims.

Sometimes victims of trafficking believe that after a period of abuse they will be able to pay off “debts” and earn money. Some think that the person or people who are trafficking them are doing so to help them. In other cases, traffickers become involved in personal relationships with victims, similar to a boyfriend/girlfriend relationship, or sometimes even marry them, as a means of controlling their victims. As time progresses, victims care little about earning any money and live an existence only at the direction of the trafficker with little or no hope of any change to their circumstances. Some victims have described the experience of being trafficked as being completely numb, doing whatever is required to prevent repeated abuse, assault and/or exploitation. This lack of power is a typical characteristic of women who have been trafficked for prostitution. It is exacerbated for foreign women who hold weak social status from their country of origin and whose victimisation may result in shame or loss of honour. This lack of power is also present for local women being trafficked in their home country, who are vulnerable from broken families, lack of friends or drug dependence.

Because of the close relationship and ‘bond’ traffickers forge with their victims, they are able to discourage them from contacting law enforcement agencies or support agencies for assistance. This is through constant and relentless conditioning which involves threatening the victim with assault, financial restrictions, and giving them an increased number of clients, in addition to removing “privileges” such as time off, sleep, food and amenities. One of the greatest obstacles law enforcement agencies face are the threats made by traffickers to the victims. If victims attempt to speak out or runaway, the traffickers threaten the victim’s family members and portray a violent scenario to them. This provides effective control of the victim without the trafficker being beside her every moment. The means by which perpetrators target victims, depends on the country they are operating in and the origin of the women. The scenario described above relates more to women from overseas with family links, as opposed to women being exploited in their home country. For example a trafficker would have much more success controlling a foreign woman in Australia with threats to their family members back home because they are isolated from their family, than they would an Australian woman in Australia. However, domestically, vulnerable women in Australia are equally exposed in terms of threats and intimidation.

Every year, governments set a directional course for their agencies to follow on a strategic blueprint. This sets their directional focus and the main areas which will be
funded. With constant public pressure to tackle drug distribution, firearms, violent crimes, property offences and road safety; less visible crime like trafficking women for prostitution often becomes a low priority. This response is largely driven by the community, who re-elect governments on a number of platforms including crime reform, which historically does not target trafficking women. This type of crime is often not at the forefront of the general public’s mind because it is seen as a “ghost crime”. It is not overtly visible and goes on behind closed doors. For this reason there is an overwhelming lack of understanding in the community about what trafficking women actually is and how destructive it can be. This lack of public knowledge of trafficking is further evidenced through the lack of intelligence gathered by police from the public through existing traditional means, such as Crime Stoppers.

This is further supported by the 2013 TIP’s report which outlines that the Government did not increase the overall number of victims identified from the previous year. A recommendation from this report is for Australia to vigorously prosecute, convict, and stringently sentence trafficking offenders, while continuing to increase efforts to train police and frontline officers to recognise indicators of trafficking and respond to suspected cases. To quote Paulo Coelho, (The Devil and Miss Prym) “When we least expect it, life sets us a challenge to test our courage and willingness to change; at such a moment, there is no point in pretending that nothing has happened or in saying that we are not yet ready. The challenge will not wait. Life does not look back. A week is more than enough time for us to decide whether or not to accept our destiny.” As suggested by Coelho, there is a need for Australia to change the way it currently tackles the crime of trafficking women.

Since the introduction of legalised prostitution in Australia, further analysis is required to establish the extent this change has had on government, law enforcement and the community’s perception of prostitution holistically. For example do people believe women must be willing participants in prostitution? An overall transformational change in mindset to understand the potential enormity of this crime and the impact that it will have on victims is now required.

A redefined strategic blueprint for Australian law enforcement agencies is needed to further focus on targeting the perpetrators of this crime who, as a result of advanced internet websites, have propelled their covert criminal activities well beyond current policing priorities, initiatives and enforcement strategies. There needs to be a complete overhaul of how government directs support towards law enforcement agencies to address these types of crimes. Speculation on how many victims there may or may not be, should not be the focus of government because this will waste more time which could be better spent on tackling the problem. Instead governments and law enforcement must make the necessary decision to target and make intelligence inroads into these crimes. All state and territory law enforcement agencies need to make trafficking women for prostitution a priority. It needs to be treated the same as more visible crimes like drug trafficking, violent crimes and the use of firearms, in order to enable tangible statistical data on victims and offenders to
be unearthed and collated. This crime needs to be investigated as part of police’s core business, rather than just isolated and infrequent attempts at operations with minimal commitment to allocated intelligence resources and coordinated investigative inroads within the community.

To effectively tackle the issue of trafficking women, police must further enlist the support of NGOs. These organisations have the unique ability to provide 24-hour victim support which means they have the perfect platform to help gather intelligence, while supporting potential victims of crime. Their ability to do this and their current support to police needs to be given greater recognition and empowerment by the government, so these organisations will become actual partners in frontline intelligence gathering through their extended networks. As previously outlined, the average Australian has an extremely limited understanding of what trafficking for sexual servitude or prostitution is, therefore they have a very limited ability to provide any information or productive intelligence to assist police investigations. Business, the mining sector and the community need far greater exposure through structured media awareness campaigns to these types of crimes to be able to boost intelligence data collection. This could be done by improving police and NGO reporting and marketing throughout the media, which would enable greater understanding of the crime, thus increase the reporting of it. This would then give police the ability to gather real-time intelligence data and give rise to opportunities for proactive and reactive strategies of enforcement.

**Mindsets**

Prostitution laws in Australia’s states and territories remain divided with differences in legislation and decriminalisation models. Currently, Victoria, New South Wales and Queensland have models of varying degrees of decriminalisation. In the remaining states and territories prostitution reform remains unchanged. Because legalised prostitution establishments exist in some states, the question posed, has this altered the mindset of the Australian community to accept prostitution in its entirety no matter what the circumstances? Is this resulting in awareness blindness to potential trafficking in persons victims being exploited within their communities?

The Queensland Commission of Audit Report and the Police and Community Safety Review (PACSR), highlighted that ‘business as usual’ is no longer a sustainable approach. The vast majority of the Australian community believes victims of trafficking in persons are foreign nationals and/or women previously exposed to the sex industry in their countries of origin. Many community members also simply choose to ignore the issues because they feel it doesn’t affect them. Trafficking women for sexual exploitation is generally considered to be a sordid topic that no one likes or wants to talk about, however, the reality is quite different, especially if we make further comparisons between Canada and Australia.
In 2010, the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) conducted a review of human trafficking cases reported to the police and intelligence agencies between 2005 and 2009. They concluded that 80 per cent of recent trafficking convictions involved victims who were citizens or permanent residents of Canada, while just 20 per cent came from other areas, mostly from Asia. These Canadian nationals were women and girls who were born and raised in that country and attended school there. Through personal circumstances they became vulnerable to the exploitation of pimps and traffickers and then became trapped in a world of prostitution where they were exploited. These women were often groomed and coerced into the sex trade by gangs. Some victims were underage girls exploited through dance clubs and escort services. They were never willing participants in the sex industry. While many members of the community have the impression that this could never happen to Australian citizens, the overwhelming reality is that it does occur but remains undetected. Girls become victims through a range of personal circumstances including broken families, dropping out of school, financial issues, drug dependency, feeling disengaged and the overwhelming need to be accepted in some circles presents an ever growing market of vulnerability for traffickers to cultivate and exploit.

During my research, I visited and conducted discussions and interviews with a number of NGOs who worked directly with victims of trafficking from a victim services perspective. The stakeholder relationships that had been forged between police and the NGOs to collect intelligence, share ideas and ultimately target traffickers through victim management and coordination was an outstanding example of professional partnerships in operation. The overwhelming findings of these NGOs, which work with trafficking cases, was that the vast majority of the girls trafficked were from either broken families or had been kicked out of the home by one or both parents, or they had been victim to some form of sexual abuse in the home by either a family member or by a family friend.

Some of the girls trafficked came from middle class families, breaking the belief that they were victims due to a lower social status. An examination of these girls established they had become disengaged from their home environment, citing they were not receiving any attention at home. In search of acceptability, the need for someone to take them seriously, or for someone to simple notice them, the girls unintentionally made themselves easy prey for the traffickers. These perpetrators see the girls’ weaknesses as opportunities to hone their skills and commence showing these girls the attention they are not receiving at home and ultimately desire.

Some NGOs cited a number of cases where they had worked with female victims under the age of 16 years, who had been recruited from schools. In one example three girls were recruited from the same high school by traffickers who knew people at the school (family or friends) and used this facade to frequent the school to meet the girls. These young men (traffickers) presented as potential suitors or friends and
ensured they hung around the school in their cars taking girls out for drives or for take-away meals. They would then provide the girls with cigarettes, alcohol or drugs. Once a relationship was formed and the girls were susceptible, the traffickers seized the opportunity and moved to the next phase of taking the girls to hotel rooms to engage in a sexual relationship with them. This eventually progressed to the girls having other males arrive, being introduced and engaging in sexual acts with them while keeping them under the influence of either alcohol or drugs or both. This clearly highlights how easy girls can become a victim of domestic trafficking within our communities.

In one of many examples I discovered in my research, a 15-year-old girl was kicked out of home after she told her mother that her mother's boyfriend had touched her inappropriately. Shortly after this, the victim left her mother's home and lived on the street, where she met a trafficker who she stayed with until she was 24. For a period of nine years, this girl remained a victim of trafficking.

In another case, cited in the Ottawa Sun Newspaper (September 5, 2013), a 18-year-old man was convicted after Judge Ann Alder in Canada was satisfied that the then 17-year-old man had used “mind games” to make sure the underage girl danced in clubs and continued to dance. The paper quoted the judge saying, “He preyed on a vulnerable, confused young woman, promising her his love and devotion to get her to dance and give him the money she made. He made it such that she wanted to please him, she wanted him to protect and love her”. The judge also found that the man assaulted the girl including twice shooting her with a Taser and invited a friend to shoot her with a paintball gun. On this occasion, it was again noted that the 16-year-old victim had problems at home, had attempted suicide and also testified that the male youth told her she could leave anytime and “it was more psychological that he held me.”

In January 2013, Edmonton police charged three young men with human trafficking, procuring for the purposes of prostitution and living off the avails of prostitution. These were two unrelated, but similar cases involving girls being lured and forced to provide sexual services in motels. Other girls played a role by luring the girls to come party. The girls were physically and sexually assaulted by their captors and confined. Advertisements were posted on an Internet sex-selling site where the girls were forced to perform sexual services for men who answered the advertisements.

In yet another case, cited in the Courier-Mail Newspaper (November 4, 2013), New Zealand police were criticised for not taking action against a group of teenage boys who had been getting girls drunk, having sex with them and naming them on the internet. The group of Auckland teenagers, who called themselves the Roast Busters, had been using Facebook since 2011 to recruit others to join them in having sex with girls and then naming them publicly. Traffickers will employ these exact types of persuasive techniques to control girls. If they don’t conform to the demands of the trafficker, the perpetrators threaten to put sexual exploitation material of the
girls online and allow it to go viral, which will impact on the victim’s entire social status and life. Every Australian parent who has a teenage daughter who has access to social media sites such as Facebook knows the overwhelming need and desire of that child for social status. They continually check in on their Facebook friends, making comments on “selfies” in what collectively appears to be many hours each day. It is a type of ritual not just confined to the house, but also at social events, while shopping and within the parameters of school activities. This obsession with social media is what drives compliance of girls with traffickers, as they are acutely aware of the ramifications that can be caused to their complete social status.

This coercive power that sex offenders can have over young girls by using social media was clearly evidenced in the tragic death of 17-year-old Rehtaeh Parsons. She was a former Cole Harbour District High School student who died after her life support was turned off by her family following an attempted suicide by hanging on 4 April 2013 at her home in Dartmouth, Nova Scotia, Canada. Her death has been attributed to the online distribution of photos of an alleged gang rape that occurred 17 months prior to her suicide, in November 2011. On a Facebook page set up in tribute to her daughter, Parsons’ mother blamed her daughter’s death on the four boys who she claimed raped and released images of her, and subjected her to constant “bullying and messaging and harassment”. She also blamed the failure of the Canadian justice system for her daughter’s decision to commit suicide.

In the region of Peel, Ontario, Canada there are a number of internet and paper advertising mediums, all of which have erotic or adult entertainment sections. Investigations of a number of these well-known internet sites that advertise escorts, massages and body rub services found the girls posting on the internet as being 18 to 19-years-old were actually more likely to be 15 to 17-years-old. Of 25 cases investigated involving human trafficking in Peel, the majority were found to involve underage females being exploited, or females who were of age but had been exploited for a period of time prior to their 18th birthdays.

While undertaking field work in Canada, with the Toronto and Peel Police, it was discovered that every day in the city over 1000 advertisements are placed openly offering the sexual services of females. Many of these females are minors being exploited by individual pimps or corporate pimps hiding under the guise of an Escort Agency or immersed into numerous internet sites as well as newspapers. To reinforce this assessment Councillor Peter Milcyzn from the city of Toronto reassessed his position on trafficking women. In the past he was of the opinion: “Let the police deal with it, or some senior officials in municipal licensing and standards”, but now the city of Toronto has taken a new stance. They acknowledge this exploitation and are considering boycotting advertising in publications with escort ads as a way of joining efforts to combat human trafficking.

The Peel Regional police department is widely considered to be the leader in the field of investigating and prosecuting traffickers in persons for sexual exploitation in
Canada. I was fortunate enough to spend a number of days with their Human Trafficking Teams (HTT) in the field, where it was estimated as many as forty percent of human trafficking cases that they prosecuted involved victims under the age of 18 years, ranging from 14 to 17-years-old. Over the past two years, they have also experienced a major increase in the number of Asian women being trafficked in the Peel Region in addition to the domestic victims being discovered.

Ownership of the problem (Trafficking In Persons)

As is the situation with solving any problem, the key driver is for someone or an agency to take ownership. The Australian Federal Police (AFP) is currently the combatant authority on human trafficking matters in Australia, with prescriptive laws and penalties designed to target the perpetrators. The overall structure of the AFP is to use its resources locally and abroad with the Department of Immigration and Boarder Protection, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) and state and tertiary police to peruse reported cases of human trafficking. The AFP has structured HTTs which are coordinated centrally along with a reportable designated email address Human-Trafficking-Group@afp.gov.au. These provide limited training due largely to the capacity and size of the federal organisation compared to the numbers of police in the state and territory jurisdictions. While the AFP has designated and specific laws to address trafficking in persons cases, they are physically restricted due to the size of the organisation. The AFP has just 6000 members to service not only Australia, but also the 31 international posts and 11 overseas missions. There are approximately 61297 state and territory police in Australia, excluding the AFP officers. These officers should be utilised more effectively in the collection of intelligence and investigations to target these crimes, especially in states and territories where no AFP officers are located.

Operational Policing Numbers:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NSW</th>
<th>Vic</th>
<th>Qld</th>
<th>WA</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>Tas</th>
<th>ACT</th>
<th>NT</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17 272</td>
<td>14881</td>
<td>13 360</td>
<td>6 790</td>
<td>5 253</td>
<td>1 249</td>
<td>841</td>
<td>1 651</td>
<td>61 297</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In remote parts of Australia, where mining communities and exploration are developing, proactively engaging members of community is a central core function of state and territory law enforcement. These officers live and work in these communities and provide a 24-hour policing response. They also forge genuine partnerships with community, local government, business and stakeholders.
Using state and territory officers in the fight against the issue of human trafficking should not be seen as a criticism of the AFP as it is not their core function. Instead, it raises the opportunity for Australia to re-examine its overall capacity to be a leading nation in the fight to target traffickers of women for prostitution, through increased targeting and intelligence data collection through the vast resources that the state and territory police are able to provide. This proposed model is similar to the Canadian model in targeting trafficking in persons crimes throughout that country. The Canadian province of Ontario has a geographical land mass of 1,076,395 square kilometres, similar in size to the state of South Australia (1,043,514 square kilometres) and operates in a similar capacity to our state and territories, with government and law enforcement structures. When it comes to criminal laws and investigations regarding trafficking, the province shares the same jurisdictional responsibilities for targeting these crimes as their National and Federal counterpart, the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP). The RCMP is similar to the AFP.

The Ontario policing model has enabled them to be proactive in intelligence collection, investigations, arrests and the prosecution of offenders on trafficking in persons investigations. These laws and powers have been introduced to enable the provincial police to investigate and prosecute offenders for these types of trafficking offences, in conjunction with the federal agency. This model has re-ignited policing activities and spawned invigorated investigative interest by the provincial police. It has allowed police to better target these perpetrators, rather than the previous model where trafficking crimes were only investigated by the RCMP. More importantly this model has resulted in increased trafficking intelligence being identified and in turn increased arrests of traffickers being made.

With state and territory police jurisdictions crimes are reported by the community through a variety of methods and are then assigned and investigated. Officers are assigned and undertake proactive taskings, collecting intelligence and actively working towards the prevention of crimes through community engagement and their own initiative. However, with no directional thrust to proactively source, collate and analyse intelligence data from trafficking crimes within the states and territories, it can be argued that if ‘we don’t see a problem, we don’t have a problem’. Similar to the Canadian model, the challenge for Australia is for all law enforcement agencies to have equal ownership of the problem of trafficking in persons and view this crime jointly in partnership with the AFP instead of in isolation. This can be achieved through a national debate to discuss the rationale of legislative changes to enable the offence of trafficking in persons to be inserted into all Australian state and territory Criminal Codes.

A national action plan uniting the combined efforts of all law enforcement agencies to be equally equipped with the same laws, powers and penalties throughout Australia is required for national unity. This would potentially activate thousands of additional police, in addition to the AFP, to be actively engaged in the search for indicators and intelligence of trafficking in persons offences. This would be particularly beneficial for
remote areas of the country where state and territory police operate. The combined collection of intelligence from all agencies with a national focus on this crime would significantly increase detection rates of perpetrators as a result of the volume of intelligence generated. Police by nature are motivated, competitive and strive to solve crimes and seek opportunities to lay charges against criminals to protect the rights of victims. One of the principals of policing by Sir Robert Peel, the founder of the Metropolitan Police Force in London, is the test of efficiency is the absence of crime and disorder. By changing how all police departments in Australia view this crime, with equal ownership with the AFP, potentially thousands of trained officers could be harnessed to look for indicators, ask the questions and initiate a potential barrage of additional intelligence. This would lead to the repatriation of victims and incarceration of perpetrators, as evidenced in Ontario, Canada, where the province and federal agency united in this quest.

**World viewpoint and Potential Economic loss**

 Trafficking in persons for sexual exploitation is not unique to developing nations; it is a worldwide phenomenon that generates enormous profits for traffickers. It is estimated that approximately 32 billion dollars per year is generated collectively from all forms of trafficking, with a significant dollar value being also attributed to women trafficked for prostitution. The Australian Crime Commission estimates that serious and organised crime costs Australia $15 billion dollars annually. Crimes associated with trafficking in women for illegal prostitution are included in this estimate, but what is not is the long-term physical and physiological harm inflicted on victims. These effects which are not captured or recorded in statistical data still place demands on Health Departments and welfare organisations for years to come.

While governments and law enforcement give their focus to more visible organised crime groups like criminal motor cycle gangs (CMG) and Asian and Eastern block crime syndicates, the less visible crime of human trafficking continues to go on. Individual traffickers and organised groups remain covert and are motivated by a strong desire to remain in the shroud of darkness. These groups make and conceal illicit profits covertly, as opposed to traditional criminal gangs which are generally more overt in their actions. The difference in profits from the sale of drugs, guns and stolen property is that once the items are sold, there is no further opportunity to make more money unless more product is created. With the trafficking of women for prostitution, the profits continue to flow either until the victim is repatriated or is of no further value. These perpetrators do not have a moral conscience nor do they adjust their behaviours over time. They look at the victim as solely a means of making money, and lots of it. They are also constantly on the lookout to groom potential future victim(s) to either add to their stable or replace women of no further value to them. The traffickers enjoy the ability to move their victims freely from locality to locality throughout the country, without the risk of additional penalty across state
borders. In the United States of America, additional or harsher penalties are imposed with the movement of trafficked women across state boundaries.

On the 17th October 2013 The British Broadcasting Commission (BBC) News World reported that according to a new index (The Global Slavery Index 2013), nearly 30 million people around the world are living as slaves. This index ranks 162 countries and its authors hope it will help governments tackle what they call a "hidden crime". The index was compiled by Australian-based rights organisation Walk Free Foundation using a definition of modern slavery that includes debt bondage, forced marriage and human trafficking. "A lot of governments won't like hearing what we have to say," WFF chief executive Nick Grono told the French news agency Agence France-Presse. The new survey has the backing of world figures including former US Secretary of State Hillary Clinton and ex-British Prime Minister Tony Blair. Mrs Clinton said that although the index was not perfect, it provided a starting point, "I urge leaders around the world to view this index as a call to action, and to stay focused on the work of responding to this crime," (Associated Press, 2013).

On 8th October 2013, the Word Bank Risk Report stated that “As the world changes, a host of opportunities arise constantly. With them, however, appear old and new risks, from the possibility of job loss and disease to the potential for social unrest and environmental damage. If ignored, these risks can turn into crises that reverse hard-won gains and endanger the social and economic reforms that produced these gains. The solution is not to reject change in order to avoid risk but to prepare for the opportunities and risks that change entails”. Due to the increased detection rates being discovered in Canada, any further lapse in response time to commit intelligence and combine resources to trafficking women may lead to condemnation. Australia can no longer ignore this issue which is evidenced around the world. Governments and law enforcement need to commit to strategic reform to address this crime.

**Organised Crime**

Indians and groups involved in organised crime immerse themselves in prostitution for a number of reasons. It’s mainly due to the simplicity in generating cash, which can be laundered afterwards without the detection methods and success that law enforcement agencies have with drugs and firearms. Unlike drugs and firearms which are prone to detection and seizure because of the physical location of the items, trafficking victims are extremely difficult to detect unless officers know and understand what to look for. With drugs and firearms and property crime, law enforcement agencies are constantly on the lookout and take appropriate actions when detected. The same cannot be said for women who are victims of trafficking for prostitution. The detection rate of trafficked victims is extremely low, compared to other trafficking offences such as drugs, but is just as profitable to the criminals.
involved. A trafficker with three females who work in adult entertainment parlours can generate more than $3000.00 per day from this activity alone. Then the perpetrator has the ability to post an advertisement and continue to sell their services over the remainder of the day.

With the progression of internet sites this type of business is totally mobile. Traffickers possess the ability to move from jurisdiction to jurisdiction, without any set-up time or waiting for ads to be posted. Through targeted operations police have discovered that many of these victims frequently move across a country as a direct result of their “pimps” attempting to avoid police interference. These circumstances make for complicated and time-consuming investigations and without individual state and territory law enforcement agencies driving the need for intelligence and proactive strategies, prosecutions remain low. Traffickers are smart and know HTTs operate from capital cities. This provides further evidence for the need of both state and territory frontline police to be actively engaged in intelligence sourcing, in addition to the effort of federal police. Working together police will enhance the national detection rate of perpetrators of this crime being apprehended.

Assessing the extent of human trafficking of women for sexual exploitation in the four countries studied as part of the fellowship is extremely difficult. Most cases are never reported to police because of the hidden nature of the offence, its links to organised crime, the reluctance of victims and witnesses to cooperate with police (because they are being threatened and manipulated by perpetrators) and the difficulty of identifying traffickers and victims. In Canada, data on human trafficking is collected through a number of channels including police-reported incidents, convictions and the assurance of temporary resident permits for suspected trafficking victims.

Although the extent of human trafficking in Canada is difficult to determine, the following available statistics, as of April 2012, provide some context:

- 25 convictions (41 victims) under human trafficking specific offences in the Criminal Code enacted in 2005. This does not include numerous other convictions for human trafficking-related conduct under other criminal offences
- Approximately 56 cases currently before the courts, involving at least 85 accused and 136 victims
- At least 26 of these victims were under the age of 18 at the time of the alleged offence
- Over 90% of these cases involve domestic human trafficking
- Less than 10% involved people being brought into Canada from another country;
- Three charges have been laid under section 118 of the Immigration and Refugee Protection Act (IRPA) which prohibits trafficking into Canada. While no convictions under that section have been registered, accused persons have been convicted under related provisions.
Unlike traditional organised criminal gangs and organisations, there is no national governance body or international governance structures like there are with Criminal Motor Gangs (CMG) or mafia-type organisations. Trafficking women for prostitution and sexual exploitation is best described as a “ghost crime”. Unlike these traditional criminal organisations, organised members who deal in human trafficking do not parade around in leather jackets or wear designer suits in public. They are the exact opposite, covert by nature like their organisations. They wish to draw as little attention to themselves as possible, which has proved to be highly successful to date given the current detection rates in many countries including Australia. However, like to their better known criminal counterparts, they do employ similar general tactics in their involvement of criminal acts. These include using:

- Illicit drugs, particularly used as a method of control compliance of addiction of victims
- Fraud
- Money laundering
- Blackmail
- Intimidation
- Assaults and sexual assault

Evidence overseas suggests that a number of massage parlours and body rub establishments in Canada and the United States of America have also been corrupted or coerced into illegal prostitution by organised crime. This is in addition to the invasion of pimps and organised crime syndicates dominating the internet web sites such as Backpages.com and Craig's List etc in order to advertise girls under a variety of different sub-headings. These include, but are not limited to:

- Escorts
- Body rubs
- Strippers and strip clubs
- Dom and fetish
- Adult jobs

It should be noted that while it is legal in some states, such as Queensland, for independent sex workers to advertise services through internet websites, it is also a vehicle for perpetrators of trafficking in persons to do the same by advertising the services of victims. The traffickers rely on volume of advertising within the internet of legitimate sex workers who are free to make choices, to then manipulate their victims within, creating the challenge for law enforcement agencies to identify victims from sex workers.

Similar to drug and firearms trafficking, trafficking in persons requires advertising in some form, whether it be covertly or overtly. One of the weaknesses of the crime and of the traffickers themselves is the requirement of the trafficker to advertise the services of the victim. They generally mask or shroud these advertisements in layers
of misleading ads on the internet, print media, massage parlours signage or through threats of assault and intimidation. Without this vehicle to advertise they are unable to access the cliental to make money, which is the sole purpose and objective of the trafficker. The traffickers’ weakness must be exploited by law enforcement agencies to unmask traffickers and identify victims. Dr D Connery (2013) in his special report for the Australian Strategic Policy Institute presented an argument for Australia to take the lead in developing nation-wide capability in this area. He said this could be done by enhancing the existing multi-jurisdictional coordination against organised crime, and providing a pool of funds to encourage all the states and territories to develop inter-operable information sharing investigative and response abilities.

Traditionally, governments are reliant on statistical data from agencies to support requests for funding through budgetary estimates committees. This is to ensure tax-payer dollars are appropriately allocated to best service the community. As discussed previously, trafficking women is a covert crime which means it’s difficult to collect statistical data on. Law enforcement and the general public’s lack of understanding of victims can also add to this because they often view victims as not willing to assist the law or as unreliable. This lack of statistical data and understanding is a major obstacle that needs to be overcome for increased funding into this area. The simple fact is that to fully investigate the nature of these crimes, law enforcement agencies require a tremendous amount of intelligence to be generated and collected with designated officers appointed to investigate and search for victims.

**The need for Intelligence**

Australia is a large dynamic country which by its geographic location, is relatively protected internally from outside countries with international human trafficking and smuggling issues. The United States of America and Canada have borders which have literally a 1000 possible points of entry which require enormous amounts of commitment and resources from Boarder Security Patrols to maintain. In Australia however, the tyranny of distances between major cities, remote towns and mining communities also provides havens for organised crime to pray upon vulnerable women and girls either sourced from abroad, interstate, major cities or locally. The traffickers are armed in the knowledge that they can operate 1000s of kilometres away from the prying eyes of Federal HTT specialists as well as state and territory police that specialise with prostitution on a daily basis, even though they are working in their borders.

A change in mindset on how government, law enforcement agencies and the community recognise the existence of this crime in Australia is essential to move forward to future-proof this nation against traffickers of women for prostitution. The challenges that currently exist and the expected expansion of traffickers in the future within this country is similar to what is being experienced in Canada and the United States of America, and it cannot be ignored.
An intelligence-led approach is critical to targeting this form of organised crime because of its illicit operations. Gaining increased intelligence drives planning and performance enabling improvements in law enforcement decision making and directional focus. This also allows for greater efficiencies in resource allocation with increased productivity and overall community safety enhancement. Police departments around the world pride themselves on the marketing that their respective organisations undertake with intelligence-driven operations, patrols and proactive engagement in the communities they serve, to target areas of criminal activity in the pursuit to stop crime. Similarly in Canada the country’s largest provincial police service, the Ontario Provincial Police (OPP), has operated a similar campaign of “intelligence-led policing” in the past as well.

However, like the OPP department, many front-line police officers’ don’t actually know the concept of the meaning of intelligence-led policing. In September 2013 at a US/Canada Border Conference, Chief Superintendent Mike Armstrong of the OPP Organised Crime Enforcement Bureau stated that, “the problem was “nobody really knew what it meant, or how to implement it and what was lacking was a sense of how to make intelligence useful at an operational level”.

The OPP set about to create a better link between the intelligence and the investigative sides, to ensure that information was going both ways. That meant also going after investigators who criticised the intelligence bureau for using out-of-date information in briefings. "If you know it, and intelligence doesn't know it, that's your fault. If you're not telling intelligence, then how are we going to get the best product possible?" Armstrong said. From this, rose a new concept of “tactical priority setting” which demonstrated the gaps of what the OPP knew about how organised crime was operating. This supports the argument that what is damaging police organisations the most about this crime, is the lack of intelligence and not the fact that the crime did not exist. In the past some held the view that if trafficking is not being reported, it must not be occurring. This outdated viewpoint must change in order to allow Australia to progress into the future to target this crime. Senior Police throughout Canada have already identified these mistakes and are now implementing focused direction in the search of traffickers and victims. The more trafficking intelligence being collected in real-time from frontline police, human trafficking teams and NGOs, the more arrests of these offences are occurring, creating a snowball type effect. This is evidenced by 72 of the 77 human trafficking prosecutions as of February 2013. These prosecutions were domestic sex-trafficking cases involving 130 defendants and 119 victims.

In November 2013, the National Military Intelligence Association (NMIA) held a symposium on Intelligence Analysis; Evolving Challenges and New Approaches. A key focus of this symposium was ‘Identity Intelligence’ which highlighted that it is not simply developing information on the identity of known or suspected threats, but to focus on how you find offenders using a wide variety of “entity management capabilities" (biometrics, cyber, open source, etc). It highlighted the fact that the
intelligence analyst's world is rapidly changing and that Australia needs to embrace a new treatments for the challenges involved in identity intelligence, to ultimately target these traffickers.

Intelligence creation nationally, driven by each state and territory must be instigated and implemented for genuine coordination to target this crime. Intelligence gathering should be focused on all victims of trafficking in addition to a much greater awareness in domestic-related victims of traffickers within each of the states and territories. Canada is similar to Australia in so many ways that a direct conclusion of what must be occurring domestically in Australia can be made. For example 72 of Canada's 77 human trafficking prosecutions as of February 2013 were domestically-related sex trafficking cases and it can be extrapolated that a similar situation would be occurring in Australia.

In the United States of America, predictive policing is also being used in the search for traffickers and victims. The use of analytical techniques is practiced to identify promising trafficking targets and identify potential victims. These techniques assist law enforcement agencies address crime problems more effectively and efficiently utilising available tools to collect data, develop crime-related forecasts, and take action in their communities. The National Institute of Justice assists law enforcement agencies to develop these intelligence assessments for making predictions and tactical approaches for acting on them. It draws on prior research, information from vendors and developers, case studies of predictive policing in practice, and lessons from the use of similar techniques in military operations. It is documented that the most effective predictive policing approaches are elements of larger proactive strategies that build strong relationships between police departments and their communities to solve crime problems. This also strengthens the argument for state and territory law enforcement agencies to be combined with existing AFP efforts in intelligence collection and targeting of offenders.

**Early Intervention and Education**

In all cases studied during my research and recounted by both Police and NGOs, victims stipulated that had they been able to receive basic forms of education on exploitation, they would have identified the indicators of a trafficker and becoming a victim earlier. They should be learning about this at a young age. The requirement to educate these young girls on the deceptive and coercion practices of traffickers cannot be understated. The more education our children receive, the greater their chances of identifying trafficking situations early and applying strategies to prevent themselves from becoming a victim.

The need exists to leverage positive communication and branding through all state and territory Departments of Education to instigate programs of awareness to high school students and their parents. This awareness and education will future proof
investment in these vulnerable years for girls ensuring awareness and preparedness, regardless of what level of education they may choose to leave the school system. It is important for a structured educational proposal be developed by state or federal government with the assistance of NGO capability and implemented into the state and territory school curriculum in years prior to these vulnerable girls leaving school. This will ensure that they have been provided an opportunity to withstand some of the pressures that will be applied to them by traffickers in the future and minimise domestic trafficking from flourishing.

Through my research with law enforcement agencies, government and NGOs overseas, backed by well-documented evidence, it’s apparent that the majority of victims do not feel comfortable speaking with police. Fear of being arrested, not having their versions of events believed or from the lies told by traffickers, that police are corrupt or that the trafficker knows the local police who will inform them if any of the girls speaks out are just some of the reasons. Sometimes the victims will connect with a victim services worker knowing they are not police officers and will be more open to receiving assistance. On many occasions the victims will eventually provide a statement even if they were hesitant at first due to the coercive mental hold that traffickers have over them. The victim will begin to trust the victim services worker and will likely be more open to speaking to the police once trust is demonstrated.

It is necessary for front line officers to also understand certain factors of foreign nationalists. Police need to acknowledge the victims’ immigration status, fear of reprisals, cultural background and the individual circumstances of these women before the process of beginning to identify them as victims can commence. In particular, women from other countries may possess a high level of susceptibility to exploitation upon arrival into Australia or the assumption of corruption of government officials and law enforcement officers. These fears are real and are based on their attitudes towards law enforcement within their country of origin and also fear that in Australia, law enforcement officers will not understand or respect their religion, culture or beliefs.

Many potential international victims also fear that accessing the criminal justice system will expose them to the risk of deportation, detention or incarceration. In countries where prostitution is illegal, people who are trafficked into the sex industry fear forced medical check-ups, forced re-socialisation and/or imprisonment upon their return to their country of origin. Many trafficked victims are told by their traffickers that the authorities are complicit with their trafficking and will harm, arrest or detain them, thereby deterring the victim from seeking assistance from police. Before identifying foreign victims of trafficking, it is necessary to acknowledge that members of immigrant communities are more vulnerable to re-victimisation because of the overwhelming fear of deportation that they believe may exist.

Seldom will victims self-report to police while being trafficked, without any form of early intervention from an NGO or law enforcement agency. However, police in
Canada and the USA have recorded successes with breaking down barriers with potential victims simply by adopting some basic practices and treatments. These include an open ability to portray non-judgemental nature when confronting potential victims and offering basic levels of support which may be the first perceived acts of kindness that the victims have been privy too in a long time. This act sets law enforcement apart from the traffickers and the clients they service. It ultimately puts them on the journey to speak out or offer evidence against the trafficker at a later time.

In 2012, the Vancouver Police Department published new Sex Work Enforcement Guidelines which highlighted the Department’s priorities and philosophy towards enforcement of sex work-related laws. Human trafficking and sexual exploitation of youth were listed as investigative priorities for the department, which provided the rationale for the response strategies to ensure a consistent and respectful approach when police are interacting with anyone involved in the sex industry. The guidelines included direction on how to respond to reports and complaints made by sex workers, upholding safety and privacy during investigations, building rapport with sex workers, and working with various partners including the Sex Worker Liaison Officer and NGO community outreach services. During my research, I observed that law enforcement agencies which had adopted this partnership and actively worked towards progressing this relationship were seen as being more successful in their operations. This was apparent in detection rates of victims and traffickers far more than in agencies that were not adopting the strategy or that simply had it written in policy but attributed no actual commitment towards a viable working relationship.

**Trafficking in Persons Laws**

It’s well-documented that human trafficking or trafficking in persons is the physical movement of people across and within borders through deceptive means, force or coercion. In Australia, once foreigners enter on a visa, borders no longer present any physical barriers for movement of victims of traffickers. As previously examined, the traffickers possess the unique ability to target vulnerable women and move from one city or town to the next easily and quickly to avoid being noticed and lessen the chances of detection by law enforcement officers. This prevents familiarity of faces particularly within smaller towns and mining communities. At a federal level, the AFP HTT is driven primarily to combat trafficking as a transnational criminal issue rather than a domestic issue. Domestically, many women that fall vulnerable to trafficking by individuals (pimps) or more organised groups don’t always fall under the label of sex workers. While they may be coerced or forced into this industry, I believe that these women fall outside the legitimate scope of being a sex worker because of the situation they are forced into and bound by. These women must be the target of law enforcement, rather than a blanket focus on the sex industry itself. Currently, states and territories have laws to target illegal prostitution related offences. As an
example, Queensland has a number of laws to target prostitution, with specific laws for additional related offences. It does not have any laws for trafficking in persons which is currently held in the federal jurisdiction with the AFP.

Under the Commonwealth Criminal Code Act 1995, Division 271 provides a number of offences for trafficking in persons and debt bondage.

Section 271.2 Criminal Code Act: Offences relating to trafficking in persons.

Section 271.6 Criminal Code Act: Offences of domestic trafficking in persons-aggravated offence.

(1) A person (the first person) commits an aggravated offence of domestic trafficking in persons if the first person commits the offence of domestic trafficking in persons in relation to another person (the victim) and any of the following applies;

- (a) the first person commits the offence intending that the victim will be exploited, either by the first person or by another, after arrival at the place to which the person has been transported
- (b) the first person, in committing the offence, subjects the victim to cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment
- (c) the first person in committing the offence; (i) engages in conduct that gives rise to a danger of death or serious harm to the victim or another person; and (ii) is reckless to that danger.

Penalty: Imprisonment for 20 years.

Queensland does possess offences that relate to prostitution, however the trafficking in persons offences under the Commonwealth Criminal Code Act that are able to be preferred by AFP officers carry a far greater penalty and are custom designed to target the perpetrators of these types of offences. The current related offences that could be applied with Queensland are:

Section 218 Criminal Code:- Procuring sexual acts by coercion etc.

(1) A person who;

- (a) by threats or intimidation of any kind, procures a person to engage in a sexual act, either in Queensland or elsewhere; or
- (b) by a false pretence, procures a person to engage in a sexual act, either in Queensland or elsewhere; or
- (c) administers to a person, or causes a person to take, a drug or other thing with intent to stupefy or overpower the person to enable a sexual act to be engaged in with the person

This is designated a crime and carries a maximum penalty of 14 years imprisonment.
Section 229FA Criminal Code; - Obtaining prostitution from a person who is not an adult.

This is designated a crime and carries a maximum penalty of seven years imprisonment.

Section 229G Criminal Code; - Procuring engagement in prostitution.

(1) A person who;

- (a) procures another person to engage in prostitution, either in Queensland or elsewhere; or

- (b) procures another person; - (i) to leave Queensland for the purpose of engaging in prostitution elsewhere; or (ii) to come to Queensland for the purpose of engaging in prostitution; or (iii) to leave the other person’s usual place of residence in Queensland for the purpose of engaging in prostitution, either in Queensland or elsewhere.

This is designated as a crime and carries a maximum penalty of seven years imprisonment. State and territory agreements need to be reached with the Federal Government on unified penalties, due to insufficient offences and reduced periods of imprisonment. This would be in the interests of national targeting to ensure that no state or territory becomes more attractive for traffickers to operate within.

**Joint Taskforce Methodology**

To effectively tackle this crime, law enforcement agencies must genuinely engage, partner and reach out further than previously explored to harness dormant and untapped sources of intelligence in the community. The community also needs to be awakened to the indicators of this crime, through the development of a nation-wide media strategy. This will highlight the gravity of this crime on victims and unlock the myths surrounding trafficking activity. While in Canada and the United States of America, I was able to observe the operations of a variety of specialised policing agencies and task force models in the pursuit of targeting traffickers of women for prostitution. In the USA, I visited Salt Lake City, Utah, where I spent a number of days with various law enforcement agencies. The Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI) and the Attorney General’s office were both-stand out agencies in this state. They both implemented designated taskforces comprising of teams of specialist officers drawn from other police jurisdictions either permanently or seconded. The teams were formed to utilise their officers’ skills towards identifying, targeting and tracking victims of forced prostitution and traffickers.

The SECURE Strike Force attached to the Utah Attorney General's office provided me with actual exposure to operations, execution of warrants, vehicle intercepts of suspects and the ability to interact with special officers within the taskforce. The
Strike Force had previously acted on information, undertaken investigations and arrested 4 traffickers and rescued 15 girls out of the massage business alone. Of note, 7 of the victims were in the country illegally. On one occasion, the suspect was sentenced to a term of life in prison.

Taskforces essentially are created by various law enforcement agencies and operate a unit of additional police, intelligence officers, investigators and other relevant stakeholders to target a specific defined activity. They have been used by government, law enforcement, military and business to tackle a specific problem and increase operational flexibility to the organisation. The main drive and success of such a unit is based on the ability to remain within scope to the set taskings that they operate in. If they are tasked to tackle human trafficking and increase detection rates, that’s exactly what they do. They are protected from outside influences because of the mandate that their agencies provide them with, including sufficient resources to operate effectively rather than a Band-Aid type environment designed for failure.

The success of taskforces in the past has been attributed to the ability of senior leaders of the organization to be decisive, unwavering in the face of adverse criticism and committed to the composition of their multi-disciplinary unit. Joint human trafficking taskforces are predominately comprised of operational police, intelligence analysts, finance and forensic specialists with a clear and decisive mandate to target the crime. Consequently, taskforces are best suited to target all aspects of human trafficking activities through the development and coordination of intelligence. Similar to the successes of previous taskforce operations, it also creates opportunities for joint partnership with other agencies due to the associated benefits of structured line control without interference.

The establishment of both state and territory taskforces would provide aggressive targeting of both domestic and foreign nationalists traffickers. These taskforces would have the responsibility for coordinating all policing activities associated with sourcing intelligence, data collection, assessment analysis, dissemination and coordination with stakeholders (including NGOs) on trafficking matters. Targeted strategies for victim identification to enable early intervention are also required to minimise harm from traffickers. To actively progress investigations into these crimes, law enforcement agencies must embrace this concept to ensure a cohesive response to these specific crimes is instigated. The alternative is to remain with prostitution and vice squads to undertake prostitution-related offences in the hope of uncovering trafficking victims. Due to existing state and territory borders, a strategic coordinated response is essential to underpin this strategy and empower intelligence-led joint task forces within each jurisdiction to target traffickers and repatriate victims.
Commitment to the Protection of Victims

Throughout the countries I visited for my research the one thing that stood out was the passion and drive of the people involved in tackling the enormous challenges of trafficking. I was privileged and humbled to observe, speak with and work beside a large number of law enforcement officers, prosecutors and dedicated NGO workers focused on the same vision. This vision is that of Luis CdeBaca, Ambassador-at-large to monitor and combat trafficking in persons, “So as this movement grows and gains momentum, the reality is that most of this crime still occurs in the shadows, unseen and beyond the reach of law, that millions of victims aren’t getting the support and services they need; that too few traffickers are being put out of business and behind bars.”

Without question, the NGOs I have visited with and spoken to in Australia and around the world are some of the most dedicated people you could ever meet. They undertake an extremely challenging but vital role in the repatriation and identification of victims. The variety of activities in relation to education, advocacy, agency support and assistance to victims is essential in supporting the victims and preparing them to provide valuable intelligence and evidence against the offenders. As we know, these victims are unlike other victims. They may have physical and physiological injuries that cause them to act differently to other victims of serious crimes. Dr Joseph Carver MD described it as the physical and mental bonds between the trafficker and the victim. It can be argued that it mimics a psychological mystery known as the Stockholm syndrome, whereby emotional bonding with an abuser is actually a strategy for survival for victims of abuse and intimidation.

The victims are typically young women and girls, from unstable or broken family relationships or who are vulnerable due to their personal situations. For example a loner, or caught-up as a result of peer pressures of wanting to fit in and being accepted by others. It is important to remember that we are dealing with XY generation women and girls who deal with enormous peer pressure to be accepted, which is magnified due to the expansion of social media sites such as Facebook. In their world often the number of Facebook friends a person has is viewed as a status symbol. Young girls will post pictures of themselves at specific times of the day in the knowledge that their photo will receive more ‘likes’ than at other times of the day or night. This status phenomenon is constantly evolving and requires parental understanding, as is the case with general internet usage amongst teenagers.

Once potential victims are identified, supporting mechanism particularly from NGOs’ work extremely effectively with protection, support and coordination of services focused on victim support. In Canada, when speaking with and observing law enforcement agencies in the field, one can see that the mindset and focus has shifted from how police have traditionally dealt with potential victims of human trafficking in first-time encounters. Any woman or girl being spoken to by police, either in a proactive prostitution operation or reactive situation (i.e. call to service for
a domestic disturbance), should be viewed as a potential victim of human trafficking. This was particularly important when dealing with disturbances at hotel and motel accommodation. These key lessons that I took from my research and observations were simplistic, but made a world of difference to the victim and underpinned a level of trust and respect which allowed victims to engage agencies at a later time when the victim was prepared to talk.

Keys points learnt while researching trafficking overseas were:

- Keeping an open mind to the situation
- Not to be judgemental towards the woman or the work that she does
- Show compassion and offer assistance if needed
- Provide a calling card with a message for assistance if required later.

**Investment in Training**

Ultimately what you put in, is what you get out and if law enforcement invests in training it will reap the benefits of more awareness of the trafficking crime. Officers that have received formal training on trafficking indicators were far more successful in questioning techniques on victims and suspects and in submitting intelligence reports on suspect activity than officers who had not. A great number of police either have limited or no understanding of trafficking in persons crimes and hold a perception that it is unlikely to occur in their area or community. This misconception is based on the belief that Australia is an advanced developed nation and members of the community and police would take action if they witnessed this crime occurring. The truth is however very different. Trafficking is considered a "ghost crime", with most people, including law enforcement officers not knowing what to look for or, worse still, being oblivious to trafficking indicators that may appear right in front of them.

The level of knowledge by police on what actually constitutes trafficking in person/s is simply due to a lack of any formalised training and practical application or exposure to specialist HTTs. Past organisational priorities of law enforcement agencies has generally created this environment which has been allowed to permeate throughout policing structures, without being vigorously challenged. The concept of trafficking in persons occurring in this country is difficult for the average person to believe or understand without factorial evidence. Hence lies the fundamental problem we face. This concept is also supported by the myth that victims of trafficking in Australia would relate only to women from overseas origins. The question that is presented is how then can this be allowed to occur within Australia’s modern-well educated society? In Canada, which has similar educational levels and attendance rates, Commonwealth status, laws, like-minded culture, size, with a slighter larger population than Australia; a staggering 80% of their identified
victims were found to be domestic related (Canadian citizens). It could be extrapolated that the same could be true for Australia.

In 2008 Churchill Fellow Detective Sergeant Mark Langhorn attached to the Victorian Police Academy undertook study on training methodology in relation to transnational crime. A key recommendation from his research then was; ‘increased education to all State police in respect of Human Trafficking’. It is reasonable to assume that this message has stalled or certainly not prioritised in accordance with law enforcement strategies to stop crime, nor has there been any significant advances within an environment of rapidly expanding internet sites to harness technology and focus on the traffickers ability to manipulate genuine sites and covertly hide victims for advertising and subsequent further exploitation.

State and territory police actively engage within their communities, to improve opportunities in the prevention of crime and the detection of criminals. Building sustainable relationships in the community and business sectors increases the agencies overall effectiveness and enhances their ability to collect intelligence. It also further increases community confidence and satisfaction in policing activities.

Throughout Australia, the vast majority of law enforcement officers have received no training on what constitutes the offence of trafficking in person/s. Commitment from government to invest in this type of training to frontline policing is urgently required to capacity build police now and into the future. The training would be in the form of trafficking indicator awareness, to enhance detection and intelligence capabilities to this crime. Without this crucial training, frontline officers will remain blinded to the illicit nature of these crimes nor can appreciate the gravity of a situation that may lie in front of them without undertaking this training awareness. A victim could present to police in a myriad of situations; a vehicle stop for a Random Breath Test (RBT), a call from hotel accommodation about a domestic disturbance or an anonymous call from a member of the public about a suspicious activity.

There are many well documented human trafficking indicators available for frontline police and emergency services personal to be aware of when dealing with a potential victim of trafficking. If these indicators are not at the forefront of inquiries, especially when dealing with young girls and women, then opportunities are being lost to target this crime.

Domestically, with residents of Australia, police and emergency personnel responding to calls for service or conducting proactive enquiries with women/girls should always be focused on these types of indicators;

- Is the woman/girl from out-of-town? Do they know the area? Why are they here?
- Is there fear, anxiety, resistance to speaking with the officer?
- Is the woman/girl with a person where there is a larger age difference?
- Does the woman/girl show signs of trauma or despair?
• Does the girl/woman sound like she has been coached when speaking with police?
• Is the woman/girl working as a sex worker? Does she have freedom of movement?
• Does the woman/girl have possession of sufficient funds?

Internationally, with citizens from abroad, police and emergency personnel will be faced with a much more difficult task. This is especially apparent with the language difficulties and depending on the Nationality of the female, distrust of authority from experiences of corruption in their homelands. Similarly, they should focus on the above indicators in addition to making additional enquires such as;

• Is the woman/girl in possession of identification? If not why not?
• What is the purpose of the woman/girls visit; study, tourist visa and is she undertaking those activities she came to Australia for?
• Has the woman/girl or her family been threatened by someone?
• Has the woman/girl ever been threatened with deportation?
• Has the woman/girl been deprived of any items?

It is critical that first response officers required to interact with any potential victims, speak with them as victims and certainly not as offenders of prostitution-related offences. Importantly, the initial contact police make with the victim may be the first encounter and opportunity for the woman or girl to see compassion, honesty and a genuine desire to help from someone. The victims certainly do not receive any of these traits from the traffickers or their male clients. The relationship can be simplified to a traffic stop where first impressions are concerned. If the only contact a member of the community has with a police officer is a bad experience regardless of the reason for the stop, then that will be the lasting impression that that person will have on the law enforcement agency. Similarly, if a potential victim is exposed to an officer who displays compassion, is non-judgemental and leaves them with a calling card for future assistance, even if the victim is not prepared or is not ready to disclose her situation to the officer at that moment in time, it paves the way for a potential disclosure at a later time.

As is well documented, many victims have been through an appalling situation due to the threats, intimidation and low self-esteem as a result of the manipulative actions of the offender. This is why the NGOs play such an important role in the outreach programs and the partnerships that are essential for intelligence collection and sharing. They are seen as non-law enforcement agencies and act as a conduit between the victim and the police. The relationship between both the NGO and police must be one of trust and mutual benefit to the victim, with a working desire to focus on prosecution of offenders. This is a challenge considering the needs of the victim are extremely important, but time is also crucial to police. Timing is important
to enable investigations to be commenced before physical evidence and versions of events are lost or distorted with risk to other victims being recruited to take the place of the repatriated victim.

**Mining Industry**

Despite the constant shifts of economic prosperity which change with economic forecasts for mineral commodities, Australia will continue to possess an overabundant wealth and ready ability to rapidly extract minerals for export. Exploration within the mining industry, fuelled by a worldwide demand for precious metals, has created a working environment that has evolved as quickly as the mines themselves. While my research was primarily focused on the impact on mining communities studied overseas, overwhelming evidence indicates that this crime can occur anywhere in the world including Australia. In Australia mining companies compete locally and interstate to attract skilled workers and labourers for expansion projects, while commodity prices remain viable. To further entice employees, companies are forced to offer additional incentives including Fly-In Fly-Out (FIFO) employment, which offers individuals opportunities to work in remote parts of Australia, returning to their homes and families in larger cities during their rest days at no cost to the employee.

The other side of this is that FIFO employment brings additional responsibilities to both mining companies and the communities they work within. Because of its remoteness mining communities present opportunities for criminal activity by traffickers moving women around for prostitution.

In Canada, it was learned that many of their sex trade workers in the cities also frequented the mining areas located in Fort McMurray, Alberta, where a number of mining operations are underway, including the Kearl Oil Sands project in the Athabasca Oil Sands region located about 70km from Fort McMurray. This open pit mine will produce an estimated 300,000 barrels of oil per day, when at maximum capacity with a mine life estimate of 5.5 billion barrels (Energy Resources Conservation Board 2010). Like many mining operations around the world, Fort McMurray is a isolated area from the major policing hubs and specialist human trafficking teams in major cities. Peel Regional Police have gained valuable intelligence on street gangs and organised crime syndicates, which facilitate the movement of many trafficking victims. They discovered that traffickers are lured by the inflated profits to be made, as opposed to other areas, simply because of the supply and demand theory of males to females. These traffickers quickly immerse themselves into mining towns and communities, understanding the shift work environment that the mining industry presents with workers willing to spend their money on any forms of legal and illegal prostitution.
The mining industry still remains a predominately closed sector due to the nature of its operations. Previous attempts to obtain data on incidents for investigations in various mines have been met with objections and a less than cooperative approach from management. The mining industry can be particularly non-transparent when it comes to any external organisation seeking information about criminal activity in and around site locations. In many cases, the sharing of intelligence data between the mining industry and law enforcement agencies is not structured or may be confined to only local policing arrangements at best. This manifests in no official collection plan for the reception of data on the FIFO workforces or the movements of the employees in these workforces, which can permit prostitution to flourish unchecked in the vicinity of mines. This lack of data can create challenges when policing mining communities and is an identifiable intelligence gap between law enforcement and individual mining companies.

However, like many organisations, mining companies must also engage in corporate social responsibility (CSR) not only to their workers, but also to the community which surrounds the mine. CSR essentially requires mining companies to encourage a positive impact through its activities on not only the environment, but all members of community, including victims of trafficking for prostitution. They need to acknowledge that both legal and illegal prostitution is associated with their industry and that these workforces drive the demand cycle for traffickers to follow. A structured concept paper needs to be developed to enable the mining industry to embrace the idea of forming genuine partnerships between law enforcement agencies and the industry. This will enable the increase of intelligence holdings with the ultimate objective to reduce the exposure of workers to victims of trafficking, as opposed to legal forms of prostitution. Companies and employers which make no concerted effort or who turn a blind eye to reducing the demand of their workforces for illegal forms of prostitution risk exposure and possible litigation from individual victims that have been exploited within these confines and by their employees.

The message to the mining industry is one of progressive negotiation with law enforcement agencies. It’s aimed at building sustainable partnerships on intelligence sharing to target both traffickers and identify unwilling victims of prostitution. Secondly, to embrace NGOs focused on threat assessments of workforces with victims of trafficking with formalised and structured training and education of employees and mine management. This would be in the form of awareness programs as to the vulnerability of some women within the sex industry. “Companies should not have a singular view on profitability. There needs to be a balance between commerce and social responsibility… The companies that are authentic about it will wind up as the companies that make more money” (Howard Schultz)
**Reason for Change**

To quote the great Winston Churchill, “Courage is what it takes to stand up and speak; courage is also what it takes to sit down and listen”. According to IBM Centre for the Business of Government, demands on governments will continue to grow while the collective resources available to meet such demands will be increasingly constrained. The centre identified the need to create a performance culture which provides incentives to use performance data to act, and enhance the role of evidence based approaches in decision making. One of the integral drivers in targeting trafficking in person’s offences is to introduce similar federal trafficking offences and penalties into Australian state and territory jurisdictions.

This is in no way designed to minimise the assets, resources and collaborative assistance that the AFP can provide, but to create a re-defined atmosphere of ownership by state and territory law enforcement agencies to this crime. As mentioned, state and territory police have many thousands of additional officers capable of sourcing intelligence, analysing for investigation to target offenders of trafficking crimes against women. Making use of these additional frontline officers in this nationally targeted approach would enable all jurisdictions, including the AFP HTT, to target this crime. This would also create revitalised local networks between state and territory police and designated NGO welfare and support networks that aid in the fight against trafficking in persons through the valuable support they provide to victims. These localised structured partnerships, particularly in remote and isolated areas, would greatly enhance increased community engagement. This is due to the valuable amount of localised intelligence, established networks and partnerships that currently exist within state and territory agencies.

In comparison to Canada and the USA, Australia is fortunate to consist of state and territory police departments that provide a comprehensive policing service throughout their respective boundaries. This internally enables effective intelligence sharing among all officers in each state and territory, ensuring efficient communication and strategic direction throughout. Each of the state and territory police departments have independent intelligence data systems that enable officers in that jurisdiction to initiate, view and update intelligence on suspected or known criminal activity. Upon the completion of awareness training in each state and territory, officers would be equipped with the knowledge to commence intelligence sharing throughout their organisations and immediately act upon any suspected trafficking activity, especially in remote areas and mining communities. It would allow police to collect intelligence, track and prosecute trafficking, just like any other criminal offence within their jurisdiction.

This would further assist with the overall coordinated sharing of vital trafficking information between state and territories and track intelligence on suspected or known pimps and traffickers moving between borders. It also provides officers with ability to track and record the movement of potential victims providing police
opportunities with each encounter to continually offer encouragement and support. The creation of trafficking offences within each state and territory combined with training would reignite the nation’s capacity to focus on a holistic approach to intelligence collection and targeting this crime.

Economic and environment factors also contribute to the reason for change and how law enforcement does business. In addition to Australia’s youth population, on 25 October 2013, Brian Williams from the Courier-Mail newspaper reported that the number of backpackers in Queensland had increased by one third in just two years. Many of these tourists will travel extensively throughout Australia in their quest for employment opportunities and to simply see the attractions that Australia has to offer through the tourism industry. Australia relies heavily on backpackers to undertake manual work during the fruit picking seasons which in turn provides many overseas backpackers the ability to earn money and extend their travel time within the country. Many younger people now seek opportunities to travel from all over the world on working visas to travel to Australia to undertake these seasonal picking duties. The number of these young transient backpacker visas jumped from 185,480 in 2010/11 to 249,231 in 2012/13. In Queensland alone, this represents 30,000 overseas young workers willing to undertake this line of employment. This also offers opportunities to traffickers to target foreign nationalists as potential victims, which has the potential to deter future backpackers away from Australia which would result in a negative impact on the economy.

In addition to these numbers, Australia currently has 450,000 foreign students undertaking studies due to the academic benefits that this country has to offer. While many of these young people work or study in Australia for economic, educational and recreational benefits, like young Australian women, some will be targeted by traffickers for prostitution. The threat of trafficking activity also has a potential to deter international students from attending universities and colleges. This could severely impact on attendance levels, revenue and placement with accommodation providers along with retail outlets. These statistics further highlight the impending urgency for government change towards a more robust and dynamic strategy to target this crime throughout Australia. This can be achieved through the systematic targeting of traffickers of women through a nationwide intelligence gathering process of all police jurisdictions.

CONCLUSIONS

During my research undertaken in Canada, USA, Philippines and Chile, I was able to expand on my learning and research conducted in 2008, undertaking the Courier-Mail Police Scholarship on Human Trafficking in the USA and Thailand. My research and learnings have been based on actual cases, physical observations and interactions with numerous law enforcement agencies in the field, government and
non-government organisations and victim support centres. As is well documented, victims of human trafficking for prostitution almost always involve young vulnerable women, with little to no ties or family. With the comparisons undertaken particularly within Canada and the USA, one would be sceptical to suggest that what is occurring in these countries (particularly in Canada) is not occurring in Australia. Canada is very similar to Australia geographically and in population, 35 million versus 25 million. The explosion in human trafficking cases, particularly of Canadian nationals, demonstrates a need for a new national strategy to be implemented. This is particularly pertinent because Canada is so similar to Australia and the parallels between the location and identification of victims there can be drawn but not ignored.

The most significant challenge to address this problem is funding in a competitive landscape of Australia which is geographically vast in size, but sparsely populated compared to other countries around the world. This creates significant government pressures on already limited funding and resource allocation to traditional and or perceived threats at any point to community safety. Funding has been easier to assign to government agencies through a system of “what gets measured gets done.” What was achieved last year will be achieved or at the very least asked to be maintained again the following year. As a consequence, this can create an almost customised financial allocation of funds and intelligence resources being directed towards drug, property and serious and violent crimes.

Historically, many people have perceived that organised crime relates mainly to the illicit drug trade, Criminal Motor Cycle Gang networks or the underworld associated with television dramas similar to the “Underbelly” series glamorising organised crime. This portrayal of organised crime has always been a cornerstone of law enforcement marketing to politicians, fellow police and members of the community which has been well supported by all forms of media who vigorously report on drug seizures, arrests and assets recovery. In the past, sanctioned police leaders have overviewed and enjoyed the successes of these types of criminal operations. They do this to position themselves to dictate the allocation of training, intelligence and resources from a finite fiscal budget based on their successes in dealing with this pattern of crime. Laura Winters, a PhD candidate who researches sex work points out the need for change by saying, “You know, to really sit there and do nothing, you are re-victimising the people who have had these experiences. They've come forward against all stigma and the stereotypes and the discrimination that these people experience when they come forward with their stories ... And by sitting on it, the government is saying, 'You know, really, you don't matter. It doesn't matter that this is happening in this province, and you know, we're not really going to do anything about it.'”

Investigating trafficking in persons crimes is extremely difficult to identify, challenging and dynamic to investigate. In the past, what has been difficult to measure has consequently been unlikely to get done and even less likely to attract funding or commitment to the allocation of any additional intelligence resources. Due to the
difficulties in reporting this crime, it has been almost impossible to grandstand to members of the community on results and achievements relating to trafficking arrests and victims being located. Without a significant increase in contributions of funding to perpetuate training, enforcement and outreach programs, the status quo will remain. Intelligence is the key driver to investigating these crimes and without investment in this area, minimal intelligence will produce minimal outcomes. What is needed to overturn this significant deficiency is a refinement on how government and law enforcement agencies perceive the problem and occurrence levels of human trafficking of women within each state and territory.

Finally, in order for Australia to progress forward, there must be a national change in mindset and an acceptance that human trafficking of women involving international and domestic woman and girls is occurring in our communities. To know how much requires an increased investment in resources and intelligence gathering assigned specifically to this crime. Unlike drug seizures, successes do not come anywhere near as often. This is because police are trained and very skilled at tackling what they can see, but it is extremely more challenging, frustrating and difficult to investigate “ghost crimes” such as trafficking in women for prostitution.

RECOMMENDATIONS

These recommendations represent significant opportunity for Australia to enhance its capacity and capability in targeting individuals and organised crime involved in trafficking in persons for prostitution. The recommendations will provide the platform to government and law enforcement agencies to provide sustainable service delivery with a whole of government approach to delivering the best possible outcomes for potential victims of trafficking within Australia.

While there have been efforts to target and disrupt perpetrators of trafficking in persons for prostitution in the past, a one government approach to providing a high level of service delivery to the community is now required. This will ensure other government agencies and relevant stakeholders play their role gathering intelligence and providing services to the community and victims.

Overall, transformational change on a national level is required to move forward in Australia. A change in both mindsets on how Australian’s perceive the problem of trafficking women for prostitution in this country, in addition to the creation of formalised structures of reporting and intelligence gathering on a national level is required. To create a successful intelligence and framework of data collection, this also needs to be overlayed with a national program of education for frontline services. These include law enforcement, emergency services, local government providers and all forms of industry which are currently exposed to potential cases of trafficking in women.
While some recommendations may take a number of years to implement, a new directional course of action must be set now to ensure that all levels of government in this country are committed to delivering genuine transformation in targeting this crime. It is imperative that federal, state and territory law enforcement agencies are supported in priority direction and receive financial incentives to formulate structures to target this crime, through designated units with national cohesion and coordination.

**Recommendations are:**

- To create an offence of trafficking in persons under the Criminal Code in all state and territories to target the specific crime of domestic trafficking for sexual exploitation
- To create a joint task force in each state and territory to coordinate the sourcing, collection and response on all facets of trafficking in persons intelligence. This would be achieved through a collaborative approach between law enforcement agencies in partnership with NGOs, emergency services, accommodation providers and the broader community
- To identify and prioritise capability training for all frontline emergency service officers, including investigation and intelligence training for law enforcement officers, incorporated with the development of nationally recognised indicators of victims of trafficking
- To create national trafficking in persons awareness programs aimed at the broader community and focused on engaging volunteers and industry groups. This will target groups - tourism industry (accommodation providers), trades and services sector (hairdressers, manicure outlets, lingerie clothing outlets etc)
- To establish centralised monitoring in each state and territory of domestic disturbances linked to the accommodation industry for mandated compliance reporting of potential trafficking in persons victims. This would be through designated intelligence officers for rapid reporting for frontline responses
- To amend the Code of Conduct and practices in the mining industry for stricter compliance of the workforce through contractual compliance reducing the demand for traffickers to operate in remote areas
- To structure the inductions of new employees in the mining industry to include training indicators of trafficking in persons victims in the sex industry, through agreed NGO service providers
- To provide suitable education and training opportunities to enable the effective and efficient delivery of awareness programs by appointed NGOs for all secondary students prior to Year 10 on indicators of domestic trafficking.

Yellow: Major Mines within Queensland.

Green: Proposed new Major mine sites in Queensland.